# The Economic Stimulus Payments of 2008 and the Aggregate Demand for Consumption 

Unpublished Appendix

Christian Broda<br>Duquesne Capital Management and NBER<br>Jonathan A. Parker<br>MIT and NBER

## Contents

- Summary statistics Table A and Table B
- Survey time and action schedule
- Mailed invitation and mailed survey, Parts I and II
- On-line survey, Parts I and II (webpages collapses onto fewer text pages)
- Response rates by wave
- Data access

Table A: The distribution of reported economic stimulus payment amounts

| ESP value | Static sample |  | Static sample with only ESPs by mail |  | Static sample with only ESPs by direct deposit |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Percent of |  | Percent of |  | Percent of |  |
|  | Number | ESPs | Number | ESPs | Number | ESPs |
| $0<\mathrm{ESP}<300$ | 348 | 1.6 | 231 | 2.1 | 116 | 1.1 |
| $E S P=300$ | 2,783 | 13.0 | 1,835 | 16.4 | 936 | 9.2 |
| 300<ESP<600 | 626 | 2.9 | 356 | 3.2 | 266 | 2.6 |
| $E S P=600$ | 7,415 | 34.7 | 4,031 | 36.1 | 3,359 | 33.1 |
| 600<ESP<900 | 402 | 1.9 | 211 | 1.9 | 187 | 1.8 |
| $E S P=900$ | 809 | 3.8 | 326 | 2.9 | 481 | 4.7 |
| $900<\mathrm{ESP}<1200$ | 304 | 1.4 | 172 | 1.5 | 132 | 1.3 |
| $E S P=1200$ | 5,202 | 24.3 | 2,819 | 25.2 | 2,372 | 23.4 |
| $1200<\mathrm{ESP}<1500$ | 153 | 0.7 | 67 | 0.6 | 86 | 0.8 |
| $E S P=1500$ | 1,440 | 6.7 | 566 | 5.1 | 871 | 8.6 |
| $1500<\mathrm{ESP}<1800$ | 124 | 0.6 | 36 | 0.3 | 88 | 0.9 |
| $E S P=1800$ | 1,197 | 5.6 | 374 | 3.3 | 820 | 8.1 |
| $1800<\mathrm{ESP}<2100$ | 42 | 0.2 | 14 | 0.1 | 28 | 0.3 |
| $E S P=2100$ | 362 | 1.7 | 98 | 0.9 | 263 | 2.6 |
| $2100<\mathrm{ESP}<2400$ | 26 | 0.1 | 4 | 0.0 | 22 | 0.2 |
| $E S P=2400$ | 100 | 0.5 | 23 | 0.2 | 77 | 0.8 |
| $2400<\mathrm{ESP}<2700$ | 8 | 0.0 | 2 | 0.0 | 6 | 0.1 |
| $E S P=2700$ | 17 | 0.1 | 2 | 0.0 | 15 | 0.1 |
| $2700<\mathrm{ESP}<3000$ | 2 | 0.0 | 2 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 |
| $E S P=3000$ | 5 | 0.0 | 3 | 0.0 | 2 | 0.0 |
| ESP>3000 | 16 | 0.1 | 9 | 0.1 | 7 | 0.1 |

Notes: Each sample includes only households that meet the standard NCP static reporting requirement for the year and report receipt during the period of the experimental variation and sufficient ESP information for the sample. All samples statistics a weighted by the NCP projection factor for 2008. Calculated based on data from The Nielsen Company (US) LLC and provid the Marketting Data Center at the University of Chicago Booth School of Business.

Table B: The temporal distribution of reported economic stimulus payments

| Week ending | Static sample |  | Static sample with only ESPs by mail |  | Static sample with only ESPs by$\qquad$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Mean ESP <br> amount \| amoun>0 | Num (\%) of week's obs with amount>0 | Mean ESP <br> amount \| amoun>0 | Num (\%) of week's obs with amount>0 | Mean ESP amount \| amoun>0 | Num (\%) of week' obs with amount>1 |
| April 26 | 933 | 163 (1) | - | - | 933 | 163 (2) |
| May 3 | 976 | 1315 (6) | 769 | 19 (0) | 981 | 1295 (13) |
| May 10 | 971 | 4854 (23) | 684 | 203 (2) | 985 | 4643 (46) |
| May 17 | 988 | 3693 (17) | 849 | 462 (4) | 1,006 | 3225 (32) |
| May 24 | 960 | 1504 (7) | 876 | 685 (6) | 1,031 | 808 (8) |
| May 31 | 885 | 803 (4) | 885 | 800 (7) | - | - |
| June 7 | 833 | 943 (4) | 833 | 937 (8) | - | - |
| June 14 | 783 | 1345 (6) | 784 | 1336 (12) | - | - |
| June 21 | 782 | 1737 (8) | 780 | 1727 (15) | - | - |
| June 28 | 786 | 1418 (7) | 787 | 1415 (13) | - | - |
| July 5 | 827 | 1066 (5) | 826 | 1064 (10) | - | - |
| July 12 | 775 | 1400 (7) | 776 | 1398 (13) | - | - |
| July 19 | 748 | 928 (4) | 748 | 923 (8) | - | - |
| July 26 | 735 | 212 (1) | 735 | 212 (2) | - | - |

Notes: Each sample includes only households that meet the standard NCP static reporting requirement for the year and report both receipt during the period of the experimental variation and sufficient ESP information for the sample. All samples statistics are weighted by the NCP projection factor for 2008. Calculated based on data from The Nielsen Company (US) LLC and provided by the Marketting Data Center at the University of Chicago Booth School of Business.

Tax Rebate Study - Time \& Action Plan

| $\#$ | Task | Start | Finish |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
|  | Online Tax Rebate Survey \#280556 - Wave 1 |  |  |
|  | Production launch Wave 1 online survey |  |  |
| $\mathbf{1 0}$ | Production launch of online Tax Rebate Full Survey | $05 / 27 / 08$ | $05 / 27 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{1 1}$ | Email reminder \#1 | $05 / 30 / 08$ | $05 / 30 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{1 2}$ | Email reminder \#2 | $06 / 05 / 08$ | $06 / 05 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{1 3}$ | Email reminder \#3 | $06 / 11 / 08$ | $06 / 11 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{1 4}$ | Close online survey | $06 / 16 / 08$ | $06 / 16 / 08$ |
|  |  |  |  |
|  | Online Tax Rebate Survey \#280556 - Wave 2 |  |  |
|  | Production launch Wave 2 non respd full online survey <br> Production launch Wave 2 Part 2 survey |  |  |
| $\mathbf{1 9}$ | Production launch of Wave 2 Non responders survey | $06 / 26 / 08$ | $06 / 26 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{2 0}$ | Email reminder \#1 | $07 / 02 / 08$ | $07 / 02 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{2 1}$ | Email reminder \#2 | $07 / 08 / 08$ | $07 / 08 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{2 2}$ | Email reminder \#3 | $07 / 11 / 08$ | $07 / 11 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{2 3}$ | Close online survey | $07 / 16 / 08$ | $07 / 16 / 08$ |
|  |  |  |  |
|  | Online Tax Rebate Survey \#280556 - Wave 3 |  |  |
|  | Production launch Wave 3 non respd full online survey |  |  |
| Production launch of Wave 3 Part 2 survey |  |  |  |
| $\mathbf{3 3}$ | Production launch of Wave 3 Non responders survey | $07 / 25 / 08$ | $07 / 25 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{3 4}$ | Email reminder \#1 | $07 / 30 / 08$ | $07 / 30 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{3 5}$ | Email reminder \#2 | $08 / 06 / 08$ | $08 / 06 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{3 6}$ | Email reminder \#3 | $08 / 13 / 08$ | $08 / 13 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{3 7}$ | Close online survey | $08 / 18 / 08$ | $08 / 18 / 08$ |


|  | Paper Tax Rebate Survey \#280532 - Wave 1 |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Programming of paper survey |  |  |
| $\mathbf{4 8}$ | Production paper mailing date | $06 / 13 / 08$ | $06 / 13 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{4 9}$ | Telecom reminders | $06 / 19 / 08$ | $06 / 19 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{5 0}$ | Telecom reminders | $06 / 26 / 08$ | $06 / 26 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{5 1}$ | Telecom reminders | $07 / 03 / 08$ | $07 / 03 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{5 2}$ | Telecom reminders | $07 / 10 / 08$ | $07 / 10 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{5 3}$ | Telecom reminders | $07 / 17 / 08$ | $07 / 17 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{5 4}$ | Close paper survey Wave 1 | $07 / 19 / 08$ | $07 / 19 / 08$ |
|  |  |  |  |
|  | Paper Tax Rebate Survey \#280532 - Wave 2 |  |  |
|  | Production launch of Wave 2 paper surveys |  |  |
| $\mathbf{6 0}$ | Production paper mailing date | $07 / 25 / 08$ | $07 / 25 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{6 1}$ | Telecom reminders (estimate) | $07 / 31 / 08$ | $07 / 31 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{6 2}$ | Telecom reminders (estimate) | $08 / 07 / 08$ | $08 / 07 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{6 3}$ | Telecom reminders (estimate) | $08 / 14 / 08$ | $08 / 14 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{6 4}$ | Telecom reminders (estimate) | $08 / 21 / 08$ | $08 / 21 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{6 5}$ | Telecom reminders (estimate) | $08 / 28 / 08$ | $08 / 28 / 08$ |
| $\mathbf{6 6}$ | Close paper surveys Wave 2 | $09 / 06 / 08$ | $09 / 06 / 08$ |

## Cover page and email request to participate and reminders

The cover of the mailed paper survey was written in the standard format in which Nielsen communicated with its panelists that do not fill out surveys on line. The email request to fill out the survey on line was similarly written in the standard format in which Nielsen communicated with its panelists who respond on line. The specific text, in the cover page or email, stated that "We could all use some extra money, and, earlier this year, the Federal government approved a one-time economic stimulus payment also referred to as a tax rebate, for some households. A special survey is enclosed regarding this rebate." Following this instruction were specific (and standard) instructions regarding how to complete the survey. In particular the survey was to be completed by "the adult household member most knowledgeable about your household's income and tax returns," underlined on the cover page and in bold in the email. Each communication also described the number of bonus gift points that would be earned by participating in the survey.

Reminders send to households by email or communicated to households by phone similarly emphasized the topic of the survey, that it should be completed by the person most familiar with the household's income and taxes, the brevity of the survey (it was estimated to take about ten minutes), and the points that completion would earn. Reminders also offered assistance through the on-line support center or by phone for any panelists encountering difficulties.

## Homescan ${ }^{\circ}$

## Tax Rebate Survey

This survey should be completed by the adult household member most knowledgeable about your household's income tax returns.

Please scan this survey barcode to begin


1. Before going on a vacation, how much time do you spend examining where you would most like to go and what you would like to do?

You will need a pencil or pen for part of this survey.


2. Many people sometimes buy things that they later wish they had not bought. About how often do you or other household members make purchases that you later regret?

3. In general, are you or other household members the sort of people who would rather spend your money and enjoy it today or save more for the future?


Save for the future

4. In case of an unexpected decline in income or increase in expenses, do you have at least two months of income available in cash, bank accounts, or easily accessible funds?

5. In the last few years, have you gathered together your household's financial information, reviewed it in detail, and formulated a financial plan for your household's long term future?


Earlier this year the Federal government approved an economic stimulus package. This year many households will receive a one-time economic stimulus payment, commonly called a tax rebate, either by check or direct deposit. This is different from a refund on your annual income taxes.
6. Has your household received a tax rebate (stimulus payment) this year?

7. In what month did you receive this tax rebate (please respond for the larger rebate if your household received more than one)?


7a. As closely as you can recall, on what day of the month did you receive the rebate? Please type your two-digit response and then press YES/ENTER when you are done. For example, if you received on the 5th of the month, type in 05. If you do not know, please type in "DO NOT KNOW" and press YES/ENTER.
8. Was this rebate received by direct deposit or check?


8a. What was the dollar amount of this tax rebate (stimulus payment)? Please type in your four-digit response into the scanner and then press the YES/enter key when you are done. For example, if it was \$650, please type 0650 and press YES/ENTER.
9. Was this about the amount your household was expecting?

No, and we were surprised to get any rebate at all

No, and it was less than we were expecting

No, and it was more than we were expecting

Yes, and we've known the approximate amount since February


Yes, and we've known the approximate amount since March


Yes, and we've known the approximate amount since April


Yes, but we only learned about it recently


Not sure/don't know

10. Thinking about your household's financial situation this year, is the tax rebate leading you mostly to increase spending, mostly to increase savings, or mostly to pay off debt?

Mostly to increase spending

Mostly to increase savings


Mostly to pay off debt

Not sure/don't know


For questions \#6 through \#10, please think about the extra amount you are spending because of this rebate on each type of purchase outlined below.

First, please use a pencil or pen to write in dollar amounts below.
Then, on the following pages, use the barcodes to scan in what those dollar amounts are.

How much (in dollars rounded to the nearest dollar) are you spending on each of the following?

You will need your pencil or pen to help with this section.


| For Question \# | Types of Purchases | Total Dollar Amount |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 11. | Food, health \& beauty aids, and household products |  $\square$ $\square$ |
| 12. | Entertainment or personal services, such as restaurants, vacations, and movie tickets |  |
| 13. | Durable goods such as appliances, electronics and furniture |  $\square$ $\square$ |
| 14. | Clothing, shoes or accessories |  |
| 15. | All other types of purchases | $\$$ $\square$ $\square$ $\square$ |

Now, please provide us with your responses by scanning one barcode in each column for each type of purchase.

Please provide the dollar amount for this type of extra spending because of the tax rebate by scanning one number in each column.

For example, for a dollar amount of \$125, you would scan 0 in the first column (Thousands), 1 in the second column (Hundreds), 2 in the third column (Tens), and 5 in the fourth column (Ones). Please scan only one barcode in each column.
11. Please scan the dollar amount you wrote on page 4 for food, health \& beauty aids, and household products.


Please provide the dollar amount for this type of extra spending because of the tax rebate by scanning one number in each column.

For example, for a dollar amount of \$125, you would scan 0 in the first column (Thousands), 1 in the second column (Hundreds), 2 in the third column (Tens), and 5 in the fourth column (Ones). Please scan only one barcode in each column.
12. Please scan the dollar amount you wrote on page 4 for entertainment or personal services such as restaurants, vacations, and movie tickets.


Please provide the dollar amount for this type of extra spending because of the tax rebate by scanning one number in each column.

For example, for a dollar amount of $\$ 125$, you would scan 0 in the first column (Thousands), 1 in the second column (Hundreds), 2 in the third column (Tens), and 5 in the fourth column (Ones). Please scan only one barcode in each column.
13. Please scan the dollar amount you wrote on page 4 for durable goods such as appliances, electronics and furniture.


Tens
Ones


2


3


4


5


7


8


9


9


Please scan this barcode when you are finished entering the dollar amount for this statement


Please provide the dollar amount for this type of extra spending because of the tax rebate by scanning one number in each column.

For example, for a dollar amount of $\$ 125$, you would scan 0 in the first column (Thousands), 1 in the second column (Hundreds), 2 in the third column (Tens), and 5 in the fourth column (Ones). Please scan only one barcode in each column.
14. Please scan the dollar amount you wrote on page 4 for clothing, shoes or accessories.


Please provide the dollar amount for this type of extra spending because of the tax rebate by scanning one number in each column.

For example, for a dollar amount of $\$ 125$, you would scan 0 in the first column (Thousands), 1 in the second column (Hundreds), 2 in the third column (Tens), and 5 in the fourth column (Ones). Please scan only one barcode in each column.
15. Please scan the dollar amount you wrote on page 4 for all other types of purchases.


Thank You For Participating! Please Transmit As Soon As Possible.

## Part One

Before going on a vacation, how much time do you spend examining where you would most like to go and what you would like to do?
E A great deal of time
E Quite a bit of time
© A little time
E Almost no time
[ Do not go on vacation
$\qquad$
Many people sometimes buy things that they later wish they had not bought. About how often do you or other household members make purchases that you later regret?
E Often
E Occasionally
$\mathbb{E}$ Rarely
[ Never

|  | Next |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |

In general, are you or other household members the sort of people who would rather spend your money and enjoy it today or save more for the future?
E Spend now
[ Save for the future
Next

In case of an unexpected decline in income or increase in expenses, do you have at least two months of income available in cash, bank accounts, or easily accessible funds?
$\mathbb{C}$ Yes
E No
Next

In the last few years, have you gathered together your household's financial information, reviewed it in detail, and formulated a financial plan for your household's long term future?
[ No

## Part Two

Earlier this year the Federal government approved an economic stimulus package. This year many households will receive a one-time economic stimulus payment, commonly called a tax rebate, either by check or direct deposit. This is different from a refund on your annual income taxes.
Next

Has your household received a tax rebate (stimulus payment) this year?
$\mathbb{C}$ Yes
[ No, but we are expecting to
E No, and we are unsure whether we will get any
E No, and we are definitely not getting one
E Not sure/don't know

| Next |
| :--- |

In what month did you receive this tax rebate (please respond for the larger rebate if your household received more than one)?
E April
$\mathbb{C}$
May
E June
E July

As closely as you can recall, on what day of the month did you receive the rebate?

```
(Click here to choose)
Next
```

Was this rebate received by direct deposit or check?
E Direct deposit to checking or savings account
[ Check by US mail
E Don't know
Next

What was the dollar amount of this tax rebate (stimulus payment)?
\$
Next

Was this about the amount you were expecting?
$\square$ No, and we were surprised to get any rebate at all
E No, and it was less than we were expecting
E No, and it was more than we were expecting
E Yes, and we've known the approximate amount since February
E Yes, and we've known the approximate amount since March
[ Yes, and we've known the approximate amount since April
[ Yes, but we only learned about it recently

## Next

Thinking about your household's financial situation this year, is the tax rebate leading you mostly to increase spending, mostly to increase savings, or mostly to pay off debt?
E Mostly to increase spending
© Mostly to increase saving
[ Mostly to pay off debt
[ Not sure/don't know
Next

For the following questions, please think about the extra amount you are spending because of this rebate. How much (in dollars rounded to the nearest dollar) are you spending on each of the following:

> Dollar Amount

Food, health \& beauty aids, and household products


Entertainment or personal services, such as restaurants, vacations, and movie tickets


Durable goods such as appliances, electronics and furniture
Clothing, shoes or accessories


All other types of purchases


```
Submit Survey
```

Response rates by survey and wave

| Online |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | actual outgoing | responded | $\begin{gathered} \text { part } 2- \\ \text { Q6=1 yes } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { part } 2- \\ \mathbf{Q 6}=2,3,5 \end{gathered}$ | part 2-Q6=4 <br> definitely not | nonrespondents | response rate |
| wave 1 (part 1 and 2) - 280556 | 46620 | 33910 | 17974 | 13831 | 2105 | 12710 | 72.7 |
| wave 2 (part 2 only) -280560 | 13407 | 11158 | 5842 | 4883 | 433 | 2249 | 83.2 |
| wave 2 (part 1 and 2) - 280683 | 9480 | 2230 | 1689 | 372 | 168 | 7250 | 23.5 |
| wave 3 (part 2 only) -280757 | 7081 | 5631 | 3957 | 1343 | 331 | 1450 | 79.5 |
| wave 3 (part 1 and 2) - 280756 | 6005 | 1133 | 945 | 108 | 80 | 4872 | 18.9 |
| Overall |  | 37273 |  |  |  |  | 80.0 |
| Paper |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| wave 1 (part 1 and 2)-280532 | 13243 | 9541 | 5544 | 3416 | 581 | 3702 | 72.0 |
| wave 2 (part 2 only) -280534 | 3408 | 2783 | 2073 | 566 | 144 | 625 | 81.7 |
| wave 2 (part 1 and 2) - 280599 | 3166 | 1634 | 1259 | 251 | 124 | 1532 | 51.6 |
| Overall |  | 11175 |  |  |  |  | 84.4 |
| total respondent count | 59863 | 48448 |  |  |  |  | 80.9 |

## Data access

The research employs data available from the Kilts Center for Marketing Research at the University of Chicago's Booth School of Business, and a tax rebates survey conducted by Nielsen on behalf of Jonathan Parker and Christian Broda. Despite our best efforts, we have been unable to get Nielsen's cooperation in setting up an archive of the data that would allow researchers to license the data (through Nielsen, the Kilts Center, the Demand Institute, and other places). That said, researchers may be able to license the data from Nielsen. Nielsen has the raw tax rebate survey data, and we are willing to cooperate and do whatever way we can to facilitate the further use of our survey.

We originally licensed the data from Ed Grove and Molly Hagen at Nielsen with contract NBT number 11611.

